

**SUPREME COURT MINUTES
MONDAY, AUGUST 3, 2020
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA**

S252915 C082664 Third Appellate District

**WILDE (LESLIE T.) v. CITY
OF DUNSMUIR**

Opinion filed: Judgment reversed

The California Constitution reserves the power of referendum to voters with specific exemptions for certain kinds of legislative enactments. The City's water rates, adopted in the Resolution at issue here, fall within the exemption for "tax levies" and therefore are not subject to referendum. We reverse the judgment of the Court of Appeal and remand for further proceedings consistent with this opinion.

Majority Opinion by Kruger, J.

-- joined by Cantil-Sakauye, C. J., Chin, Corrigan, Liu, Cuéllar, and Groban, JJ.

S256927

**IXCHEL PHARMA, LLC v.
BIOGEN, INC.**

Opinion filed

We hold that tortious interference with at-will contracts requires independent wrongfulness. Because Ixchel alleges that Biogen interfered with its at-will contract, it must allege that Biogen did so through wrongful means.

We also hold that a rule of reason applies to determine the validity of a contractual provision by which a business is restrained from engaging in a lawful trade or business with another business. Section 2.13 of the Biogen-Forward Agreement is such a restraint because it prevents Forward from collaborating with Ixchel or any other partner in the development of treatments containing the active ingredient DMF. Its validity under section 16600 must therefore be evaluated based on a rule of reason. We express no view on the validity of the agreement at issue.

Majority Opinion by Liu, J.

-- joined by Cantil-Sakauye, C. J., Chin, Corrigan, Cuéllar, Kruger, and Groban, JJ.

S263417 A160433 First Appellate District, Div. 3

**JOHNSON III (JESSE) ON
H.C.**

Petition for review granted; transferred to Court of Appeal, First Appellate District, Division Three, with directions to issue an order to show cause

The petition for review is granted. The matter is transferred to the Court of Appeal, First Appellate District, Division Three. That court is ordered to vacate its summary denial dated

July 9, 2020, and is further ordered to issue an order to show cause, returnable before the Marin County Superior Court and to further direct the Marin County Superior Court to consolidate this matter with *In re Ian Michael Hall, et al.* (Marin County Superior Court Case No. SC212933).
Votes: Cantil-Sakauye, C. J., Chin, Corrigan, Liu, Cuéllar, Kruger, and Groban, JJ.

S263462 A160501 First Appellate District, Div. 1 **JOHNSON (WAYNE) ON H.C.**
Petition for review granted; transferred to Court of Appeal, First Appellate District, Division One, with directions to issue an order to show cause

The petition for review is granted. The matter is transferred to the Court of Appeal, First Appellate District, Division One. That court is ordered to vacate its summary denial dated July 17, 2020, and is further ordered to issue an order to show cause, returnable before the Marin County Superior Court and to further direct the Marin County Superior Court to consolidate this matter with *In re Ian Michael Hall, et al.* (Marin County Superior Court Case No. SC212933).
Votes: Cantil-Sakauye, C. J., Chin, Corrigan, Liu, Cuéllar, Kruger, and Groban, JJ.

S250670 F073515 Fifth Appellate District **PEOPLE v. GARCIA (EDGAR ISIDRO)**
S250218 F072943 Fifth Appellate District **PEOPLE v. VALENCIA (JOSE LUIS)**

Counsel appointment order filed

Upon request of appellant Edgar Isidro Garcia for appointment of counsel, the Central California Appellate Program is hereby appointed to represent appellant on the appeal now pending in this court.
Appellant's brief on the merits must be served and filed on or before thirty (30) days from the date respondent's opening brief on the merits is filed.

S262401 C089271 Third Appellate District **PEOPLE v. HAWK (SHAWN)**
Counsel appointment order filed

Upon request of appellant for appointment of counsel, the Central California Appellate Program is hereby appointed to represent appellant on the appeal now pending in this court.

S262660 C088072 Third Appellate District **PEOPLE v. FARRAJ (TAHER GHAZI)**
Counsel appointment order filed

Upon request of appellant for appointment of counsel, the Central California Appellate Program is

hereby appointed to represent appellant on the appeal now pending in this court.

S262740 C089529 Third Appellate District

**PEOPLE v. THLANG
(SANBEIRA)**

Counsel appointment order filed

Upon request of appellant for appointment of counsel, Joshua L. Siegel is hereby appointed to represent appellant on the appeal now pending in this court.

S254599 B289852 Second Appellate District, Div. 5

**GADLIN (GREGORY) ON
H.C.**

Motion denied

Petitioners' motion for preliminary relief filed July 29, 2020, is denied without prejudice to the filing of a renewed motion in this court if circumstances warrant.

S257081 B292106 Second Appellate District, Div. 5

**ADAMS (RONALD LEE) ON
H.C.**

Motion denied

Petitioners' motion for preliminary relief filed July 29, 2020, is denied without prejudice to the filing of a renewed motion in this court if circumstances warrant.

S257104 B293475 Second Appellate District, Div. 5

**BERTRAM (TIMOTHY) ON
H.C.**

Motion denied

Petitioners' motion for preliminary relief filed July 29, 2020, is denied without prejudice to the filing of a renewed motion in this court if circumstances warrant.

S260851 B296112 Second Appellate District, Div. 5

**ELLINGTON (MARCUS
RUBEN) ON H.C.**

Motion denied

Petitioners' motion for preliminary relief filed July 29, 2020, is denied without prejudice to the filing of a renewed motion in this court if circumstances warrant.